# IN THE UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE

IN DE.	)
IN RE:	Chapter 11
BUILDING MATERIALS HOLDING	)
CORPORATION, et al.,1	Case No. 09-12074 (KJC)
Debtors.	)
Debtors	Jointly Administered
	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
	Ref. Docket Nos. 1302
	)

# FEE AUDITOR'S FINAL REPORT REGARDING SIXTH MONTHLY AND FINAL APPLICATION OF BENESCH, FRIEDLANDER, COPLAN & ARONOFF, LLP

Direct Fee Review LLC ("DFR"), appointed and employed as the Fee Auditor in the above-captioned bankruptcy proceedings and acting in its capacity regarding the Sixth Monthly and Final Application of Benesch, Friedlander, Coplan & Aronoff, LLP for allowance of compensation for services rendered and reimbursement of expenses as counsel to the Official Committee of Unsecured Creditors for the interim period December 1, 2009 through January 3, 2010 ("Interim Fee Request") seeking approval of fees in the amount of \$23,838.00 and reimbursement of expenses in the amount of \$556.19, and for the final period June 26, 2009 through January 3, 2010 ("Final Fee Request") seeking approval of fees in the amount of \$121,851.50 and reimbursement of expenses in the amount of \$2,665.22, submits its final report.

The Debtors, along with the last four digits of each Debtor's tax identification number, are as follows: Building Materials Holding Corporation (4269), BMC West Corporation (0454), SelectBuild Construction, Inc. (1340), SelectBuild Northern California, Inc. (7579), Illinois Framing, Inc. (4451), C Construction, Inc. (8206), TWF Construction, Inc. (3334), H.N.R. Framing Systems, Inc. (4329), SelectBuild Southern California, Inc. (9378), SelectBuild Nevada, Inc. (8912), SelectBuild Arizona, LLC (0036), and SelectBuild Illinois, LLC (0792). The mailing address for the Debtors is 720 Park Boulevard, Suite 200, Boise, Idaho 83712.

#### BACKGROUND

In performance of audit procedures and in preparation of this report designed to quantify and present factual data relevant to the requested disbursements and expenses contained herein, DFR reviewed the monthly fee statements and the fee requests, including each of the expense entries listed in the exhibits to the monthly statements, for compliance with 11 U.S.C. § 330, Rule 2016-2 of the Local Rules of the United States Bankruptcy Court for the District of Delaware, as amended February 1, 2009 ("Local Rules"), and the United States Trustee Guidelines for Reviewing Applications for Compensation and Reimbursement of Expenses Filed Under 11 U.S.C. § 330, issued January 30, 1996 ("Guidelines").

# **DISCUSSION**

For the compensation period of December 1, 2009 through January 3, 2010 Benesch, Friedlander, Coplan & Aronoff, LLP submitted an Interim Fee Request in the amount of \$23,838.00 as actual, reasonable and necessary fees and reimbursement of expenses in the amount of \$556.19. For the Interim Fee Request period \$2,726.00 was charged for fee applications.

1. Based upon our procedures applied to the Interim Fee Request for December 1, 2009 through January 3, 2010 we have noted that a material amount of time in this fee application is related to the preparation of fee applications. We deem it generally acceptable to spend less than \$50,000 or 5% of time charged preparing fee applications. We apply these guidelines on a cumulative basis. We noted that for the Final Fee Request period the firm has charged \$9,774.50 and we have calculated that 8.02% of the charges relate to fee applications on a cumulative basis. We do not have an objection to the

amount of fees and we deem the percentage to be reasonable.

2. Based upon a review for reasonableness DFR noted entries which provide a description of "various emails". These do not provide sufficient detail to allow the determination of "reasonable and necessary" and the qualitative value of the task. Also, local rule 2016-2 (d) (vii) states that activity descriptions shall not lumped; each activity shall have a separate description and a time allotment. We have made the request in the past to ensure that such entries better identify each participant, the subject and the participant role. We requested that the firm confirm that all of the "various emails" entries are not clerical communication traffic which could have been processed by a timekeeper with a lower cost to the estate. After review by the firm of these charges the firm did confirm that the role of the participant was not clerical. Additionally, the firm withdrew fee charges in the amount of \$230.00; we recommend a reduction in fees for this amount.

# FINAL APPROVAL OF FEES AND EXPENSES

3. The firm previously filed the First Interim Quarterly Fee Request for the period June 26, 2009 through August 31, 2009 and the Second Interim Quarterly Fee Request for the period September 1, 2009 through November 30, 2009. We reviewed these fee requests and filed our reports with the Court recommending approval of fees after in the total amount of \$98,013.50 and expenses after adjustments in the total amount of \$2,109.03 for the period June 26, 2009 through November 30, 2009.

# **CONCLUSION**

Regarding the Interim Fee Request period and the fees and expenses discussed in the

previous sections, DFR submits its final report for the Interim Fee Request of Benesch,

Friedlander, Coplan & Aronoff, LLP as counsel to the Official Committee of Unsecured

Creditors for allowance of compensation for services rendered and reimbursement of

expenses for the period from December 1, 2009 through January 3, 2010 and we recommend

the approval of fees in the amount of \$23,608.00 (\$23,838.00 less \$230.00) and the

reimbursement of expenses in the amount of \$556.19. We have no changes to make to our

reports related to the period June 26, 2009 through November 30, 2009 and therefore

continue to recommend approval of fees in the total amount of \$98,013.50 and expenses in

the total amount of \$2,109.03 for that period. For the Final Fee Request period from June 26,

2009 through January 3, 2010 we recommend the approval of fees in the amount of

\$121,621.50 (\$121,851.50 less \$230.00) and the reimbursement of expenses in the amount of

\$2,665.22.

Respectfully submitted,

DIRECT FEE REVIEW LLC

Rv.

W. J. Dryel

5068 W. Plano Parkway

Suite 300

Plano, TX 75093

Telephone: 972-381-4255

Telephone: 609-432-3428

Dfr.wid@gmail.com

FEE AUDITOR

-4-

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing document has been served by First Class United States mail to the attached service list on this 28th day of January, 2010.

By:

W. J. Dryer

SERVICE LIST
Notice Parties

#### The Applicants

Benesch Friedlander Coplan & Aronoff LLP Attn: Bradford J. Sandler, Jennifer R. Hoover, Jennifer E. Smith 222 Delaware Ave., Suite 801 Wilmington, DE 19801

## The Debtor

Building Materials Holding Corporation Attn: Paul S. Street 720 Park Boulevard Suite 200 Boise, ID 83712

### **Counsel to the Debtors**

Young Conaway Stargatt & Taylor, LLP Attn: Sean M. Beach and Robert F Poppiti, Jr. The Brandywine Building, 1000 West Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor PO Box 391 Wilmington, DE 19899-0391

Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher LLP Attn: Michael A. Rosenthal and Matthew K. Kelsey 200 Park Avenue New York, NY 10166

#### Counsel to the Committee

Benesch Friedlander Coplan & Aronoff LLP Attn: Bradford J. Sandler, Jennifer R. Hoover, Jennifer E. Smith 222 Delaware Ave., Suite 801 Wilmington, DE 19801

Arent Fox LLP Attn: Christopher J. Giaimo, Jr. and Katie A. Lane 1050 Connecticut Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20036

## Office of the United States Trustee

OFFICE OF THE U.S. TRUSTEE Attn: Joseph McMahon 844 King Street, Suite 2207 Wilmington, DE 19801